How State Legislative “Laboratories” Can Use Healthcare Claims Data to Advance Consumer Protection Laws: A Detailed Case Study

Robin Gelburd, President

October 3, 2017
FAIR Health Mission

Origins: Established as conflict-free, independent, national not-for-profit

Mission: To bring clarity to healthcare costs and health insurance information

Impact: Widespread recognition from diverse stakeholder groups, including state leaders

Action: Fulfills mission with robust data products, award-winning consumer tools and research platform
# The FAIR Health Repository

| Procedures from 2002 to the Present from Medical and Dental Claims | >24B |
| Covered Lives | >150M |
| Geozip Regions Reflecting Local Billing Patterns | 493 |

## Coverage
- All 50 States and District of Columbia,
- US Territories – Puerto Rico, Guam, US Virgin Islands

## 60 Contributors
- National and regional payors
- Third-party administrators

## Private Insurance Claims
- Fully insured and self-insured/ERISA plans
- Cover 75% of privately insured US population

## Quality Testing and Control
- Data validated with expert-vetted tests for completeness, volume, accuracy, etc.
- Recognized statistical outlier methodologies

- One of only five organizations across the country entitled to receive Parts A, B and D Medicare data for all 50 states
- Issue probing reports on key aspects of healthcare industry/provider performance
- Powerful synergies between our private claims data and Medicare collection of claims
- Over 55 million beneficiaries; data from 2013-Present
# FAIR Health State Applications

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Alaska        | • Workers’ compensation fee schedule  
                • Out-of-network claims pricing under the state health insurance plan  
                |                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Arizona       | • Dental claims reimbursement for disabled pediatric patients  
                |                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| California    | • Benchmark for emergency care for low-income patients  
                |                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Connecticut   | • FAIR Health 80th percentile benchmark designated as UCR for emergency services  
                |                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Florida       | • FAIR Health consumer website transparency featured by Insurance Consumer Advocate  
                • Ground and air ambulance data comparisons and analytics  
                |                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Georgia       | • Worked with the state to update and distribute their workers’ compensation fee schedule  
                |                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Kentucky      | • Data support workers’ compensation fee schedule  
                |                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Mississippi   | • “Usual and customary” charges under workers’ compensation fee schedule are based on the FAIR Health 40th percentile  
                |                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| New Jersey    | • Authorized personal injury protection (auto liability) reimbursement standard  
                • Department of Banking and Insurance recognizes FAIR Health as consumer information source  
                |                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| New York      | • Medical indemnity fund for birth-related neurological impairments  
                • Benchmark for consumer cost transparency and dispute resolution  
                • Medicaid program support  
                |                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| North Dakota  | • Data used to inform the state’s workers’ compensation fee schedule  
                |                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Pennsylvania  | • “Usual and customary” standard in the workers’ compensation program is based on the FAIR Health 85th percentile  
                |                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Texas         | • Department of Insurance links consumers to FAIR Health for help with surprise bills  
                |                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Wisconsin     | • Certified for use for workers’ compensation fees  
                |                                                                                                                                                                                                     |

**Consumer Protection Laws:** In addition to assisting Connecticut and New York, which already use FAIR Health benchmarks under laws on out-of-network emergency and surprise bills, FAIR Health has provided testimony, webinars and comparative datasets for executive branch officials, legislators and other stakeholders in Arizona, Connecticut, Colorado, Georgia, Indiana, Massachusetts, Missouri, Nevada, New Jersey, New Mexico, Oregon, Pennsylvania, Rhode Island, Texas, Utah and Washington.

**Opioid Studies:** FAIR Health’s white papers on the increasing diagnoses, costs, demographics and geographic variations in the nationwide opioid epidemic have been featured in hundreds of media outlets and attracted policy makers. FAIR Health is assisting the President’s Commission on Combating Drug Addiction and the Opioid Crisis, members of both parties in both Houses of the US Congress, and officials in federal agencies and in Florida, Ohio and other states.
State Consumer Protection Laws Incorporating FAIR Health Data

• New York:
  o 80th percentile of charges for a particular service in a particular geographic area
  o As reported in a benchmarking database maintained by a conflict-free not-for-profit organization not affiliated with an insurer or similar organization
  o Plans are not required to reimburse at 80th percentile level but must articulate how they reimburse in comparison to UCC
  o Supports “apples to apples comparisons”
  o Supports dispute resolution

• Connecticut:
  o FAIR Health 80th percentile is the UCR standard for payments for out-of-network emergency services

FAIR Health: the only data source officially recognized by both states
Quasi-APCD: largest private insurance claims collection

- Nationally and locally representative
- Basis for benchmarks for official codes and geozips based on claims for recent 12-month period
- Benchmarks in percentile ranges of charges and allowed amounts

Specific charge or allowed percentile benchmark can serve as

- Reference point
- Mandatory payment
- Factor for dispute resolution

Single specific standard aids certainty and transparency

- Reduces disputes
- Helps payors and providers to plan and budget
- Facilitates comparative disclosure of plans’ reimbursement formulae
- Simplifies consumer information tools
FAIR Health Support for Consumer Protection Laws

- Comparative Data and Analytics
  - Values comparing allowed and charge amounts
    - Different percentiles featured
  - Comparisons of commercial data to Medicare
  - Trending over time
  - Variety of state geographic groupings
  - Comparisons to different jurisdictions and national variations
  - Feature codes frequently implicated by surprise bills
    - Hospital-based services such as radiology, pathology, emergency, etc.
  - Highlight place of service
  - Charts, graphs, heat maps, histograms
  - Episodes of Care benchmarks

- Presentations
- Written Testimony
- Webinars
Example Distribution of Charges

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Procedure Code</th>
<th>CPT 99213</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Code Description</td>
<td>OFFICE OUTPATIENT VISIT 15 MINUTES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geozip</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geographic Description</td>
<td>NY-MANHATTAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Module</td>
<td>Medical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Release</td>
<td>November 2016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The graph above illustrates actual charges for the specific procedure and geozip region set forth above. The geozip includes the place of service in this matter, as reported to FAIR Health.
# FAIR Health and CMS: A Comparison

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>FAIR Health Data</th>
<th>Medicare Fee Schedule</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Geography</strong></td>
<td>• Most benchmarks are organized into 493 regions</td>
<td>112 Geographic Practice Cost Indices (GPCIs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Custom regions available</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Methodology</strong></td>
<td>• FH® Charge Benchmarks based directly on actual charges in specific region; for infrequently performed procedures, a relative market value methodology is applied</td>
<td>• Relative values and conversion factors set by committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• FH® Allowed Benchmarks reflect imputed allowed amounts for specific regions; for infrequently performed procedures, a relative market value methodology is applied</td>
<td>• Geographical adjustments for GPCI areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Some procedures omitted as not relevant to covered population</td>
<td>• Some procedures omitted as not relevant to covered population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Relationship to Market</strong></td>
<td>• Mirror market distribution of charges and allowed amounts and also reflect market differentials for charges and allowed amounts as between specialized categories of services</td>
<td>• Fees adjusted to meet national budget and policy objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Reflect the experience of the privately insured</td>
<td>• Not all procedures are covered because system was designed for particular populations: the elderly, disabled and end-stage renal disease patients</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Comparative fees for different types of specialists often differ from market relationships</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Dispute Resolution

FAIR Health data: choice of both parties to resolve disputes

- Facilitated settlement of suit involving 38 states and Washington, DC; challenge to reimbursement amounts

- 80th percentile benchmark agreed upon as a standard for “usual and customary” charge for five years


- Other cases settled in Oregon, Washington
Thank You

Robin Gelburd
President
212-370-0704
rgelburd@fairhealth.org

For more information, visit:
• fairhealth.org
• fairhealthconsumer.org / consumidor.fairhealth.org
• Mobile App: FH® Cost Lookup / FH® CCSalud